



# Self-reflection vs. self-evaluation: Understanding your employees' perceptions

Sharon Holderman  
Tennessee Tech University  
sholderman@tntech.edu

July 2020



## What's the difference?

- ▶ Self-evaluation
- ▶ Self-reflection



## Self-evaluation accuracy

- ▶ Evaluation ratings in general
  - ▶ Number scales
  - ▶ Word scales
- ▶ Self-evaluation ratings
- ▶ Better than average effect
  - ▶ Who they compare to
  - ▶ What they compare



## My previous library

- ▶ Evaluations once a year
- ▶ Employee completed same evaluation
- ▶ I completed official evaluation
- ▶ We met to discuss



## A story of two very different employees

- ▶ Low performer
  - ▶ Lack of skills
  - ▶ Tried hard
  - ▶ Very high self-evaluation
  
- ▶ High performer
  - ▶ Went above and beyond
  - ▶ Had high expectations
  - ▶ Mediocre self-evaluation



## Self-evaluations

- ▶ Pros
  - ▶ Learn their performance perceptions
  - ▶ Can help you complete your evaluation
  
- ▶ Cons
  - ▶ Accuracy
  - ▶ Limited scope
  - ▶ Expectations of use
  - ▶ Creates a conflict situation



## My current library

- ▶ Evaluations once a year
- ▶ Employee completes annual report (includes self-reflection)
- ▶ I complete official evaluation
- ▶ We meet to discuss



## Annual report content

- ▶ Activities & accomplishments
- ▶ Professional development
- ▶ Committees and service
- ▶ Goals



## Annual report content

- ▶ Activities & accomplishments
- ▶ Professional development
- ▶ Committees and service
  
- ▶ Goals
  
- ▶ Self-reflection portion
  - ▶ What was your greatest achievement last year?
  - ▶ What skills do you want to acquire this year?



## What I have learned

- ▶ "Achievement" varies widely
- ▶ Where their interests lie
- ▶ What they love and hate
- ▶ They appreciate the interest



The most fascinating thing...

I had to ask



A story of two similar employees

- ▶ Day circulation supervisor
- ▶ Night circulation supervisor
- ▶ Self-evaluations = similar results
- ▶ Self-reflections...



## Discovering talents

- ▶ People are different
- ▶ Treating them the same
- ▶ Treating them equally



## Self-reflections

- ▶ Pros
  - ▶ Scalable (2 questions or 10)
  - ▶ Learn more than just performance perception
  - ▶ Better evaluation meeting conversations
- ▶ Cons
  - ▶ May be harder to incorporate
  - ▶ It's a change



## Incorporating self-reflection

- ▶ Replace your current system
- ▶ Combine it with your current system
- ▶ Create a separate process



## Additional self-reflection topics

- ▶ What is one of your strengths you don't use?
- ▶ How have you grown professionally this year?
- ▶ How would you like to grow professionally?
- ▶ What motivates you?
- ▶ What would make your job more enjoyable?
- ▶ What was the easiest/hardest thing you did?
- ▶ What would you change about your job?
- ▶ What's your biggest obstacle at work?





# Questions?

[sholderman@tntech.edu](mailto:sholderman@tntech.edu)